



THIRD SECTION

CASE OF BOCHAROV AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA

*(Applications nos. 74497/17 and 37 others –
see appended list)*

JUDGMENT

STRASBOURG

9 November 2023

This judgment is final but it may be subject to editorial revision.

In the case of Bocharov and Others v. Russia,

The European Court of Human Rights (Third Section), sitting as a Committee composed of:

Peeter Roosma, *President*,

Ioannis Ktistakis,

Andreas Zünd, *judges*,

and Viktoriya Maradudina, *Acting Deputy Section Registrar*,

Having deliberated in private on 19 October 2023,

Delivers the following judgment, which was adopted on that date:

PROCEDURE

1. The case originated in applications against Russia lodged with the Court under Article 34 of the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (“the Convention”) on the various dates indicated in the appended table.

2. The Russian Government (“the Government”) were given notice of the applications.

THE FACTS

3. The list of applicants and the relevant details of the applications are set out in the appended table.

4. The applicants complained of the inadequate conditions of their detention. Some applicants also raised other complaints under the provisions of the Convention.

THE LAW

I. JOINDER OF THE APPLICATIONS

5. Having regard to the similar subject matter of the applications, the Court finds it appropriate to examine them jointly in a single judgment.

II. JURISDICTION

6. The Court observes that the facts giving rise to the alleged violations of the Convention occurred prior to 16 September 2022, the date on which the Russian Federation ceased to be a party to the Convention. The Court therefore decides that it has jurisdiction to examine the present applications (see *Fedotova and Others v. Russia* [GC], nos. 40792/10 and 2 others, §§ 68-73, 17 January 2023).

III. ALLEGED VIOLATION OF ARTICLE 3 OF THE CONVENTION

7. The applicants complained principally of the inadequate conditions of their detention. They relied on Article 3 of the Convention.

8. The Court notes that the applicants were kept in detention in poor conditions. The details of the applicants' detention are indicated in the appended table. The Court refers to the principles established in its case-law regarding inadequate conditions of detention (see, for instance, *Muršić v. Croatia* [GC], no. 7334/13, §§ 96-101, ECHR 2016; *Kudła v. Poland* [GC], no. 30210/96, §§ 90-94, ECHR 2000-XI; and *Ananyev and Others v. Russia*, nos. 42525/07 and 60800/08, §§ 139-65, 10 January 2012). It reiterates in particular that extreme lack of space in a prison cell or overcrowding weighs heavily as an aspect to be taken into account for the purpose of establishing whether the impugned detention conditions were "degrading" from the point of view of Article 3 and may disclose a violation, both alone, or taken together with other shortcomings (see, amongst many authorities, *Muršić*, cited above, §§ 122-41, and *Karalevičius v. Lithuania*, no. 53254/99, §§ 36-40, 7 April 2005).

9. In the leading case of *Sergey Babushkin v. Russia*, no. 5993/08, 28 November 2013, the Court already found a violation in respect of issues similar to those in the present case.

10. Having examined all the material submitted to it, the Court has not found any fact or argument capable of persuading it to reach a different conclusion on the admissibility and merits of these complaints. Having regard to its case-law on the subject, the Court considers that in the instant case the applicants' conditions of detention were inadequate.

11. These complaints are therefore admissible and disclose a breach of Article 3 of the Convention.

IV. OTHER ALLEGED VIOLATIONS UNDER WELL-ESTABLISHED CASE-LAW

12. Some applicants submitted other complaints which also raised issues under the Convention, given the relevant well-established case-law of the Court (see appended table). These complaints are not manifestly ill-founded within the meaning of Article 35 § 3 (a) of the Convention, nor are they inadmissible on any other ground. Accordingly, they must be declared admissible. Having examined all the material before it, the Court concludes that they also disclose violations of the Convention in the light of its well-established case-law (see *Gorlov and Others v. Russia*, nos. 27057/06 and 2 others, 2 July 2019, concerning permanent video surveillance of detainees and lack of an effective remedy in that respect).

V. REMAINING COMPLAINTS

13. Finally, some applicants complained under Article 13 of the Convention about the lack of an effective domestic remedy in respect of the inadequate conditions of their detention. In the light of its findings in paragraphs 10-12 above, the Court considers that there is no need to deal separately with the remaining complaints.

VI. APPLICATION OF ARTICLE 41 OF THE CONVENTION

14. Regard being had to the documents in its possession and to its case-law (see, in particular, *Sergey Babushkin v. Russia* (just satisfaction), no. 5993/08, 16 October 2014, and *Mozharov and Others v. Russia*, nos. 16401/12 and 9 others, 21 March 2017), the Court considers it reasonable to award the sums indicated in the appended table.

FOR THESE REASONS, THE COURT, UNANIMOUSLY,

1. *Decides* to join the applications;
2. *Holds* that it has jurisdiction to deal with these applications as they relate to the facts that took place before 16 September 2022;
3. *Declares* the complaints under Article 3 of the Convention concerning the conditions of the applicants' detention after conviction, and other complaints raised by the applicants under the well-established case-law of the Court (see appended table), admissible, and *finds* that it is not necessary to deal separately with the complaints raised under Article 13 of the Convention about the lack of an effective domestic remedy to complain about poor conditions of detention;
4. *Holds* that these applications disclose a breach of Article 3 of the Convention concerning the inadequate conditions of detention after conviction;
5. *Holds* that there has been a violation of the Convention as regards the other complaints raised under the well-established case-law of the Court (see the appended table);
6. *Holds*
 - (a) that the respondent State is to pay the applicants, within three months, the amounts indicated in the appended table, to be converted into the currency of the respondent State at the rate applicable at the date of settlement;

BOCHAROV AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

(b) that from the expiry of the above-mentioned three months until settlement simple interest shall be payable on the above amounts at a rate equal to the marginal lending rate of the European Central Bank during the default during the default period plus three percentage points.

Done in English, and notified in writing on 9 November 2023, pursuant to Rule 77 §§ 2 and 3 of the Rules of Court.

Viktoriya Maradudina
Acting Deputy Registrar

Peeter Roosma
President

BOCHAROV AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

APPENDIX

List of applications raising complaints under Article 3 of the Convention
(inadequate conditions of detention after conviction)

| No. | Application no. Date of introduction | Applicant's name Year of birth | Representative's name and location | Facility Start and end date Duration | Inmates per brigade Sq. m per inmate Number of toilets per brigade | Specific grievances | Other complaints under well-established case-law | Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹ |
|-----|---|---|------------------------------------|---|--|--|--|--|
| 1. | 74497/17 20/12/2017 | Oleg Yuryevich BOCHAROV 1981 | | IK-49 Komi Republic 18/08/2016 to 05/11/2021 5 year(s) and 2 month(s) and 19 day(s) | 2-2.71 m ² | lack of fresh air, overcrowding, poor quality of potable water, lack of or insufficient electric light, lack of or insufficient natural light | | 12,500 |
| 2. | 11691/18 27/01/2018 | Sergey Aleksandrovich SAVCHENKO 1980 | | IK-7 St Petersburg 13/11/2015 to 28/08/2017 2 year(s) and 9 month(s) and 16 day(s) | 100 inmate(s) 2.24 m ² 3 toilet(s) | overcrowding, lack of privacy for toilet, insufficient number of toilets and wash basins | | 6,500 |
| 3. | 31714/21 18/05/2021 | Yuriy Aleksandrovich DIKOVCHENKO 1981 | | IK-18 Murmansk Region 01/05/2010 pending as of 16/09/2022 12 year(s) and 4 month(s) and 16 day(s) | < 2 m ² | poor quality of food, overcrowding, lack of privacy for toilet, lack of or inadequate hygienic facilities, lack or insufficient quantity of food | | 9,000 |

BOCHAROV AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

| No. | Application no. Date of introduction | Applicant's name Year of birth | Representative's name and location | Facility Start and end date Duration | Inmates per brigade Sq. m per inmate Number of toilets per brigade | Specific grievances | Other complaints under well-established case-law | Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹ |
|-----|--------------------------------------|--|------------------------------------|---|--|--|--|--|
| 4. | 32246/21 31/05/2021 | Boris Vitalyevich POTEKHIN 1989 | | IK-2 Zabaykalskiy Region 28/10/2019 pending as of 16/09/2022 2 year(s) and 10 month(s) and 20 day(s) | 100 inmate(s) 1.6-1.9 m ² 4 toilet(s) | overcrowding, no or restricted access to warm water, no or restricted access to shower, no or restricted access to toilet, lack of privacy for toilet, lack of fresh air | | 9,000 |
| 5. | 33867/21 15/06/2021 | Umardzhon Umarovich SHERBOBOYEV 1982 | | IK-8 Komi Republic 18/10/2018 pending as of 16/09/2022 3 year(s) and 10 month(s) and 30 day(s) | 160 inmate(s) 2 m ² 4 toilet(s) | overcrowding, lack of fresh air, inadequate temperature, lack of or inadequate hygienic facilities, lack of privacy for toilet, no or restricted access to running water, poor quality of food, lack or insufficient quantity of food, poor quality of potable water | | 9,000 |
| 6. | 35304/21 02/06/2021 | Mikhail Mikhailovich SHIBADAYEV 1993 | | KP-14 Krasnoyarsk Region 01/10/2020 pending as of 16/09/2022 1 year(s) and 11 month(s) and 16 day(s) | 60 inmate(s) 2 toilet(s) | lack of or inadequate hygienic facilities, lack of privacy for toilet, no or restricted access to shower | | 8,100 |
| 7. | 36904/21 29/06/2021 | Andrey Aleksandrovich VYSHKEVICH | | IK-5 Krasnoyarsk Region 14/09/2016 | 120 inmate(s) 3-3.3 m ² 4 toilet(s) | lack of fresh air, lack of or inadequate hygienic facilities, lack of privacy for toilet, lack or inadequate furniture, no or restricted access to shower, overcrowding | Art. 8 (1) - permanent video surveillance of detainees in pre-trial or post-conviction detention facilities - detention in different | 11,400 |

BOCHAROV AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

| No. | Application no. Date of introduction | Applicant's name Year of birth | Representative's name and location | Facility Start and end date Duration | Inmates per brigade Sq. m per inmate Number of toilets per brigade | Specific grievances | Other complaints under well-established case-law | Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹ |
|-----|--------------------------------------|--|--|---|--|---|--|--|
| | | 1983 | | pending as of 16/09/2022 6 year(s) and 3 day(s) | | | cells with video surveillance by opposite-sex operators; Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of permanent video surveillance in detention facilities | |
| 8. | 38021/21 30/05/2021 | Stanislav Petrovich LEVCHUK 1983 | Alekseyeva Natalya Vasilyevna Krasnoyarsk | KP-3 Orlov Region 21/06/2018 to 26/05/2022 3 year(s) and 11 month(s) and 6 day(s) | 75 inmate(s) 2 m ² | lack of fresh air, lack of privacy for toilet, overcrowding | | 8,000 |
| 9. | 41349/21 12/01/2022 | Leonid Alekseyevich AVVAKUMOV 1986 | | IK-5 Krasnoyarsk Region 04/12/2014 pending as of 16/09/2022 7 year(s) and 9 month(s) and 13 day(s) | 14 inmate(s) 1.4 m ² 5 toilet(s) | lack of or insufficient electric light, lack of fresh air, no or restricted access to toilet, lack of privacy for toilet, poor quality of food | Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of permanent video surveillance in detention facilities; Art. 8 (1) - permanent video surveillance of detainees in pre-trial or post-conviction detention facilities – by opposite-sex operators during all those years of detention in IK-5 Krasnoyarsk Region | 7,300 |
| 10. | 41864/21 29/06/2021 | Yuriy Mikhaylovich BOGDANOV 1967 | | IK-8 Komi Republic 20/09/2019 to 22/09/2021 2 year(s) and 3 day(s) | 2 m ² | overcrowding, lack of fresh air, inadequate temperature, poor quality of potable water, no or restricted access to warm water, mouldy or dirty cell, lack of privacy for toilet, poor quality of food, lack of toiletries | | 5,800 |

BOCHAROV AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

| No. | Application no. Date of introduction | Applicant's name Year of birth | Representative's name and location | Facility Start and end date Duration | Inmates per brigade Sq. m per inmate Number of toilets per brigade | Specific grievances | Other complaints under well-established case-law | Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹ |
|-----|--------------------------------------|---|------------------------------------|---|--|---|---|--|
| 11. | 44458/21 17/08/2021 | Aleksandr Vladimirovich KHROMYSHEV 1982 | | IK-24 Komi Republic 08/10/2019 pending as of 16/09/2022 2 year(s) and 11 month(s) and 9 day(s) | 180 inmate(s) 1.1 m ² 5 toilet(s) | bunk beds, infestation of cell with insects/rodents, lack of fresh air, lack of or inadequate hygienic facilities, lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen, lack of or restricted access to leisure or educational activities, lack of or inadequate furniture, overcrowding, mouldy or dirty cell, poor quality of potable water, no or restricted access to warm water, lack of privacy for toilet, poor quality of food | | 8,300 |
| 12. | 46388/21 02/09/2021 | Sergey Aleksandrovich YEROFEYEV 1982 | | IK-8 Komi Republic 02/07/2019 pending as of 16/09/2022 3 year(s) and 2 month(s) and 15 day(s) | 2 m ² | overcrowding, lack of fresh air, inadequate temperature, lack of or inadequate hygienic facilities, lack of or insufficient physical exercise in fresh air, lack of privacy for toilet, mouldy or dirty cell, no or restricted access to potable water, no or restricted access to warm water, poor quality of food | | 8,300 |
| 13. | 48147/21 08/09/2021 | Yevgeniy Nikolayevich BLAGIKH 1981 | | IK-29 Kirov Region 27/07/2017 pending as of 16/09/2022 5 year(s) and 1 month(s) and 21 day(s) | 2 m ² | overcrowding, poor quality of potable water, lack of or inadequate hygienic facilities, poor quality of food, no or restricted access to toilet, inadequate temperature | Art. 8 (1) - permanent video surveillance of detainees in pre-trial or post-conviction detention facilities – video surveillance by opposite-sex operators during those past years of detention | 10,700 |
| 14. | 48617/21 06/09/2021 | Pavel Aleksandrovich GLAZIN 1980 | | IK-8 Komi Republic 06/09/2018 27/11/2021 3 year(s) and 2 month(s) and 22 day(s) | 2 m ² | overcrowding, lack of fresh air, inadequate temperature, no or restricted access to potable water, sharing cells with inmates infected with contagious disease, lack of privacy for toilet, poor quality of food, mouldy or dirty cell | | 5,800 |

BOCHAROV AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

| No. | Application no. Date of introduction | Applicant's name Year of birth | Representative's name and location | Facility Start and end date Duration | Inmates per brigade Sq. m per inmate Number of toilets per brigade | Specific grievances | Other complaints under well-established case-law | Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹ |
|-----|---|---|------------------------------------|---|--|--|--|--|
| 15. | 49162/21 10/09/2021 | Andrey Vladimirovich MYMRIK 1973 | | IK-19 Komi Republic 24/11/2019 pending as of 16/09/2022 2 year(s) and 9 month(s) and 24 day(s) | 1.9 m ² 10 toilet(s) | overcrowding, lack of or inadequate hygienic facilities, lack of or restricted access to leisure or educational activities, no or restricted access to toilet, no or restricted access to running water, lack of or insufficient physical exercise in fresh air, poor quality of food, inadequate temperature | | 8,300 |
| 16. | 50070/21 22/09/2021 | Igor Vyacheslavovich LADANOV 1969 | | IK-19 Komi Republic 09/05/2020 pending as of 16/09/2022 2 year(s) and 4 month(s) and 8 day(s) | 0.5-1.2 m ² | overcrowding, bunk beds, lack of or inadequate hygienic facilities, lack of privacy for toilet, lack of or insufficient natural light, poor quality of food, lack of fresh air, no or restricted access to toilet, lack of or insufficient physical exercise in fresh air | | 8,000 |
| 17. | 52032/21 01/10/2021 | Viktor Aleksandrovich MOSKALEV 1977 | | IK-8 Komi Republic 11/10/2019 to 15/09/2022 2 year(s) and 11 month(s) and 5 day(s) | 2 m ² | overcrowding, lack of fresh air, no or restricted access to potable water, inadequate temperature, lack of or inadequate hygienic facilities, lack of privacy for toilet, poor quality of food, lack of or insufficient physical exercise in fresh air, poor quality of potable water, no or restricted access to toilet | | 8,000 |
| 18. | 52592/21 04/10/2021 | Aleksandr Yuryevich PASHINOV | | IK-5 Krasnoyarsk Region 29/03/2017 | 130 inmate(s) 2,3 m ² 8 toilet(s) | overcrowding, lack of toiletries, lack of or inadequate hygienic facilities, poor quality of food, no or restricted | | 8,000 |

BOCHAROV AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

| No. | Application no. Date of introduction | Applicant's name Year of birth | Representative's name and location | Facility Start and end date Duration | Inmates per brigade Sq. m per inmate Number of toilets per brigade | Specific grievances | Other complaints under well-established case-law | Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹ |
|-----|--------------------------------------|---|------------------------------------|--|--|---|--|--|
| | | 1983 | | pending as of 16/09/2022 5 year(s) and 5 month(s) and 19 day(s) | | access to running water, lack of or insufficient electric light, lack of privacy for toilet | | |
| 19. | 55865/21 22/10/2021 | Yefrem Mikhaylovich IVANOV 1986 | | Settlement colony no. 14 Krasnoyarsk Region 28/07/2020 to 28/09/2021 1 year(s) and 2 month(s) and 1 day(s) | 50 inmate(s) 2.5 m ² 3 toilet(s) | overcrowding, lack of privacy for toilet, no or restricted access to warm water, no or restricted access to toilet, lack of fresh air, lack of or inadequate hygienic facilities | | 5,000 |
| 20. | 57504/21 11/11/2021 | Yuriy Vladimirovich KLIMOV 1984 | | IK-29 Kirov Region 05/07/2017 pending as of 16/09/2022 5 year(s) and 2 month(s) and 12 day(s) | 140 inmate(s) 1.5 m ² | overcrowding, bunk beds, lack of fresh air, mouldy or dirty cell, lack of or inadequate hygienic facilities, poor quality of potable water | | 7,800 |
| 21. | 58442/21 11/11/2021 | Valeriy Yuryevich KUKANOV 1976 | | IK-29 Kirov Region 03/08/2017 pending as of 16/09/2022 | 1.8 m ² | overcrowding, bunk beds, lack of or inadequate hygienic facilities, lack of or restricted access to leisure or educational activities, poor quality of food, poor quality of potable water, no or restricted access to running water, sharing cells with inmates infected with contagious | Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of permanent video surveillance in detention facilities; Art. 8 (1) - permanent video surveillance of detainees in pre-trial or post-conviction | 10,100 |

BOCHAROV AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

| No. | Application no. Date of introduction | Applicant's name Year of birth | Representative's name and location | Facility Start and end date Duration | Inmates per brigade Sq. m per inmate Number of toilets per brigade | Specific grievances | Other complaints under well-established case-law | Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹ |
|-----|---|--|------------------------------------|---|--|---|---|--|
| | | | | 5 year(s) and 1 month(s) and 14 day(s) | | disease, no or restricted access to toilet, inadequate temperature | detention facilities - detention in different cells with video surveillance, opposite-sex operators | |
| 22. | 60203/21 23/11/2021 | Andrey Viktorovich TARASOV 1971 | | IK-2 Zabaykalskiy Region 20/02/2019 to 26/03/2020 1 year(s) and 1 month(s) and 7 day(s) The applicant made use of the new remedy introduced by the Compensation Act. Final decision dismissing his claims: Supreme Court of Russia on 07/07/2021 | 2.5 m ² | overcrowding, lack of fresh air, passive smoking, inadequate temperature, mouldy or dirty cell, infestation of cell with insects/rodents, lack of privacy for toilet, poor quality of food, no or restricted access to warm water, lack of or restricted access to leisure or educational activities | | 5,000 |
| 23. | 61556/21 01/12/2021 | Vyacheslav Nikolayevich KURIKALOV 1985 | | IK-2 Zabaykalskiy Region 07/06/2017 pending as of 16/09/2022 | 2 m ² | bunk beds, lack of fresh air, lack of or inadequate hygienic facilities, lack of or insufficient electric light, lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen, lack of or restricted access to leisure or educational activities, sharing cells with inmates infected with contagious disease, poor quality of food | | 7,500 |

BOCHAROV AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

| No. | Application no. Date of introduction | Applicant's name Year of birth | Representative's name and location | Facility Start and end date Duration | Inmates per brigade Sq. m per inmate Number of toilets per brigade | Specific grievances | Other complaints under well-established case-law | Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹ |
|-----|--------------------------------------|--|------------------------------------|--|--|--|---|--|
| | | | | 5 year(s) and 3 month(s) and 10 day(s) | | | | |
| 24. | 614/22 03/12/2021 | Aleksey Vladimirovich GAGARIN 1976 | | IK-29 Kirov Region 27/08/2017 pending as of 16/09/2022 5 year(s) and 21 day(s) | 150 inmate(s) 1.2 m ² 8 toilet(s) | overcrowding, lack of fresh air, lack of or inadequate hygienic facilities, lack or inadequate furniture, poor quality of potable water, no or restricted access to warm water, lack of privacy for toilet, lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen, lack of requisite medical assistance | | 7 500 |
| 25. | 2179/22 11/03/2022 | Ramiz Makhir Ogly ALIYEV 1998 | | IK-24 Krasnoyarsk Region 21/12/2017 pending as of 16/09/2022 4 year(s) and 8 month(s) and 27 day(s) | 2.66 m ² | overcrowding, inadequate temperature, lack of fresh air, lack of or inadequate hygienic facilities, mouldy or dirty cell, poor quality of food, lack of or restricted access to leisure or educational activities | | 6,800 |
| 26. | 3675/22 24/01/2022 | Vladimir Bogdanovich ZAKHARENKO 1992 | | IK-4 Magadan Region 22/12/2017 pending as of 16/09/2022 4 year(s) and 8 month(s) and 26 day(s) | 1.3 m ² | overcrowding, lack of privacy for toilet, lack of or insufficient natural light, lack of or insufficient physical exercise in fresh air | | 7,000 |
| 27. | 9616/22 09/01/2022 | Vasiliy Mikhaylovich NAZAROV | | IK-7 Krasnoyarsk Region; IK-24 Krasnoyarsk Region | 118- 163 inmate(s) 2.14-2.36 m ² | overcrowding, lack of or inadequate hygienic facilities, lack of privacy for toilet, overcrowding | Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of permanent video surveillance in detention; | 9,400 |

BOCHAROV AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

| No. | Application no. Date of introduction | Applicant's name Year of birth | Representative's name and location | Facility Start and end date Duration | Inmates per brigade Sq. m per inmate Number of toilets per brigade | Specific grievances | Other complaints under well-established case-law | Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹ |
|-----|--------------------------------------|--|------------------------------------|---|--|--|---|--|
| | | 1985 | | 31/01/2018 pending as of 16/09/2022 4 year(s) and 7 month(s) and 15 day(s) | 5 toilet(s) | | Art. 8 (1) - permanent video surveillance of detainees in pre-trial or post-conviction detention facilities – during the entire period of detention by opposite-sex operators | |
| 28. | 11013/22 01/02/2022 | Aleksandr Dmitriyevich ALFEROV 1976 | | IK-5 Krasnoyarsk Region 27/09/2019 pending as of 16/09/2022 2 year(s) and 11 month(s) and 21 day(s) | 2.3 m ² | lack of privacy for toilet, poor quality of food, overcrowding | | 7,000 |
| 29. | 11815/22 21/02/2022 | Aleksandr Aleksandrovich VORONIN 1972 | | IK-4, Magadan Region 20/10/2020 pending as of 16/09/2022 1 year(s) and 10 month(s) and 28 day(s) | 1 m ² | overcrowding, lack of privacy for toilet, lack of fresh air, lack of or insufficient physical exercise in fresh air | | 6 800 |
| 30. | 12322/22 15/04/2022 | Aleksandr Anatolyevich TULUSH 1975 | | IK-24 Irkutsk Region 02/09/2020 pending as of 16/09/2022 2 year(s) and 15 day(s) | 150 inmate(s) 0.3-0.8 m ² 6 toilet(s) | overcrowding, poor quality of food, lack of privacy for toilet, no or restricted access to toilet, inadequate temperature, lack of fresh air | | 6,500 |

BOCHAROV AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

| No. | Application no. Date of introduction | Applicant's name Year of birth | Representative's name and location | Facility Start and end date Duration | Inmates per brigade Sq. m per inmate Number of toilets per brigade | Specific grievances | Other complaints under well-established case-law | Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹ |
|-----|--------------------------------------|--|---|---|--|---|--|--|
| 31. | 18012/22 21/02/2022 | Valeriy Vasilyevich YELIN 1979 | | IK-4 Magadan Region 01/03/2014 pending as of 16/09/2022 8 year(s) and 6 month(s) and 16 day(s) | 6 inmate(s) 2.6 m ² 1 toilet(s) | lack of or insufficient physical exercise in fresh air, lack or inadequate furniture, overcrowding, lack of or insufficient natural light, bunk beds | | 6,800 |
| 32. | 18026/22 21/02/2022 | Artur Ramilevich BIKEYEV 1990 | | IK-4 Magadan Region 12/07/2017 to 14/04/2022 4 year(s) and 9 month(s) and 3 day(s) | 2.3 m ² | lack of fresh air, lack of or inadequate hygienic facilities, lack of privacy for toilet, bunk beds, deterioration in conditions of detention (cumulative effect of lack of physical exercise, breaches of the hygiene regulations, lack of contact with the outside world and uncertainty) | | 5,500 |
| 33. | 18234/22 26/02/2022 | Yevgeniy Vladimirovich CHADOV 1984 | Khakhilev Vyacheslav Anatolyevich Arkhangelsk | IK-4 Arkhangelsk Region 08/08/2018 pending as of 16/09/2022 4 year (s) and 1 month(s) and 9 day (s) | 90 inmate(s) 1.6 m ² 2 toilet (s) | overcrowding, lack of or inadequate hygienic facilities, poor quality of food, no or restricted access to shower, no or restricted access to toilet, lack of fresh air | | 6,800 |

BOCHAROV AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

| No. | Application no. Date of introduction | Applicant's name Year of birth | Representative's name and location | Facility Start and end date Duration | Inmates per brigade Sq. m per inmate Number of toilets per brigade | Specific grievances | Other complaints under well-established case-law | Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹ |
|-----|---|---|------------------------------------|---|--|--|---|--|
| 34. | 21557/22 31/03/2022 | Vyacheslav Viktorovich KISELEV 1978 | | IK-35 Perm Region 14/04/2021 pending as of 16/09/2022 1 year(s) and 5 month(s) and 3 day(s) | 90 inmate(s) 1.2 m ² 4 toilet(s) | overcrowding, mouldy or dirty cell, no or restricted access to toilet, lack of or insufficient natural light | | 6,600 |
| 35. | 28058/22 23/05/2022 | Yevgeniy Mikhailovich KRASNOV 1973 | | IK-4 Magadan Region 01/09/2018 pending as of 16/09/2022 4 year(s) and 16 day(s) | 6 inmate(s) 2.5 m ² 1 toilet(s) | overcrowding, lack of or inadequate hygienic facilities, lack of requisite medical assistance, lack of or insufficient natural light | Art. 8 (1) - permanent video surveillance of detainees in pre-trial or post-conviction detention facilities – during the entire period of detention by the opposite-sex operators | 6,000 |
| 36. | 35381/22 25/06/2022 | Vadim Mikhailovich BEZRUKOV 1975 | | IK-24, Komi Republic 12/08/2019 pending as of 16/09/2022 3 year(s) and 1 month(s) and 5 day(s) | 0.5 m ² | overcrowding, lack of privacy for toilet, infestation of cell with insects/rodents, lack of fresh air, poor quality of food | | 5,800 |

BOCHAROV AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

| No. | Application no. Date of introduction | Applicant's name Year of birth | Representative's name and location | Facility Start and end date Duration | Inmates per brigade Sq. m per inmate Number of toilets per brigade | Specific grievances | Other complaints under well-established case-law | Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹ |
|-----|---|--|---|--|--|---|--|--|
| 37. | 38597/22 18/07/2022 | Oleg Nikolayevich MIKHAYLOV 1982 | | IK-19 Komi Republic 18/08/2019 pending as of 16/09/2022 3 year(s) and 30 day(s) | 2 m ² | overcrowding, inadequate temperature, lack of fresh air, lack of or restricted access to leisure or educational activities, no or restricted access to shower, lack of or insufficient physical exercise in fresh air, poor quality of food | | 5,500 |
| 38. | 5346/23 16/01/2023 | Vafa Umyarovich SALEKHOV 1967 | Prozorov Artem Andreyevich Furmanov | IK-6 Kirov Region 07/07/2011 to 08/11/2018 7 year(s) and 4 month(s) and 2 day(s) The applicant made use of the new remedy introduced by the Compensation Act. Final decision by the Supreme Court of Russia on 16/09/2022. Domestic courts confirmed the lack of personal space, overcrowding, lack of privacy for toilet, | 230 inmate(s) 0.9 m ² 5 toilet(s) | lack of or insufficient electric light, lack of or insufficient natural light, lack of privacy for toilet, overcrowding | | 5,000 |

BOCHAROV AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

| No. | Application no. Date of introduction | Applicant's name Year of birth | Representative's name and location | Facility Start and end date Duration | Inmates per brigade Sq. m per inmate Number of toilets per brigade | Specific grievances | Other complaints under well-established case-law | Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹ |
|-----|---|-----------------------------------|------------------------------------|--|--|---------------------|--|--|
| | | | | insufficient natural and electric light, and granted the applicant RUB 30,000 (approximately 300 euros). | | | | |

¹ Plus any tax that may be chargeable to the applicants.